

Guidelines for Writing a Critique

- **Begin with an introduction.** The introduction familiarizes readers with the essay under discussion, provide a context for the writing and **state a clear thesis.**
- **Summarize main points.** The summary tells readers what major points the student made in the essay on the novel to support his or her position.
- **Analyze how well the writer has achieved his or her purpose.** The analysis tells readers what aspects of the work you have examined, depending on the assignment that was to be followed. In general assess the overall presentation of evidence, judging its validity, accuracy, significance, and fairness.
- **Explain your response to the writing.** The response tells readers your personal viewpoint by explaining the extent to which you agree or disagree with the writer of the essay. Remember you read the book too, and you should be able explain your position.
- **Conclude with your observations of the overall effectiveness of the writing and your personal views on the subject they chose to write about.** The conclusion summarizes the results of your analysis and your overall judgment of the essay.

Student Name
Section

Attach this form to the end of your two page Critique.

Critique on Novel

Title of Paper & Number: _____

Name _____

This assignment is to be completed in the following manner. You and one other person in this class are to read an essay assigned to you. Next, review this list thoroughly and talk together about the 18 items and take notes. You will spend two class periods discussing this paper. The paper will be collected after each period. On the third class period you are to open a new file and write your critique in narrative form. Be sure you plan ahead of time how you will organize this writing. **You will only use your notes on the third class period when you write about two pages double-spaced for this writing. Be critical, but constructive in your remarks. Show me how much you understood the concepts in this class by referencing your knowledge in what you say in this critique. This assignment is worth 20% of your grade. I will grade you in the same manner as the other four papers you wrote during the quarter.**

Overall Rating of the essay you are evaluating: __Excellent __Good __Poor

Reasons for this rating:

1. Ideas - Challenging/New/Expected/Common
2. Strategy Used [How the ideas were set up]
3. Unity in the paper: Thesis/Paragraphs/Sentences
4. Use of literary language
5. Uses and knows well one, two or three of the Approaches to literature
6. Understands the elements of fiction:
character/setting/plot/theme/meaning/symbol/point of view (refer to the pages in your Charters' reader).
7. How extensive are grammatical errors in sentence structure?
8. How sloppy are the uses of mechanics? [spelling, capitalization, indentation etc.]
9. Do the ideas cohere [make sense].
10. How interesting are the ideas and how they are presented?
11. Does the writer *use present historic tense*?
12. Which are the major strengths and weaknesses—make a list for each.
13. What constructive ideas can you provide?
14. How would you have approached this paper on this subject?
15. What are major inaccuracies, if any?
16. How is the documentation in the body and in Works Cited presented?
17. Does the writer use many paraphrases, or more direct quotes?
18. Overall what is most impressive or most bothersome?